



*Senate Standing Committee*  
*on*  
*Constitutional and Legal Affairs*

**Report on**  
**The Clauses of The National**  
**Compensation Bill 1974**

JULY 1975

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

1975—Parliamentary Paper No. 142

*Senate Standing Committee*  
*on*  
*Constitutional and Legal Affairs*

**Report on**

**The Clauses of The National  
Compensation Bill 1974**

JULY 1975

---

*Brought up and*  
*ordered to be printed 22 July 1975*

---

THE GOVERNMENT PRINTER OF AUSTRALIA  
CANBERRA 1976

Members of the Committee

Senator M.G. Everett (Tasmania) Chairman  
Senator J.N. Button (Victoria)  
Senator F.M. Chaney (Western Australia)  
Senator D.J. Grimes (Tasmania)  
Senator A.J. Missen (Victoria)  
Senator the Hon. R.C. Wright (Tasmania)

Former Members of the Committee

Senator P.D. Durack (Western Australia)

(Senator Durack ceased to be a member of the Committee on 5 January 1975 and was replaced by Senator Wright on the same day)

Senator J.R. McClelland (New South Wales)

(Senator McClelland then chairman of the Committee ceased to be a member of the Committee on 12 February 1975 and was replaced by Senator Grimes on 18 February 1975)

Secretary - Mr Michael Dixon  
The Senate  
Parliament House  
Canberra

Telephone 726737

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Paragraph	Page
Abbreviations used in this report		vii
<u>CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION</u>	1.1 to 1.30	1
1. The Reference	1.1 to 1.6	1
2. Evidence and Submissions	1.7 to 1.9	2
3. Brief outline of the scheme	1.10 to 1.20	3
4. The Committee's attitude to the Bill	1.21 to 1.24	6
5. Commencement	1.25 to 1.28	12
6. Application of the Bill	1.29 to 1.30	13
<u>CHAPTER 2 ABOLITION OF COMMON LAW REMEDIES</u>	2.1 to 2.42	14
1. Bureaux as Against Courts	2.1 to 2.7	14
2. Fault or No Fault	2.8 to 2.24	15
3. Cost of Common Law Remedies	2.25 to 2.34	23
4. Pain and Suffering and Provision for Disfigurement	2.35 to 2.42	26
<u>CHAPTER 3 CONSTITUTIONAL VALIDITY</u>	3.1 to 3.5	30
<u>CHAPTER 4 THE COST OF THE SCHEME</u>	4.1 to 4.15	34
<u>CHAPTER 5 METHOD OF FINANCING</u>	5.1 to 5.7	44
<u>CHAPTER 6 FINANCIAL AND ECONOMIC EFFECTS</u>	6.1 to 6.17	50
1. Effects on Private Insurance Industry	6.2 to 6.8	50
2. Effect on State Government Finances	6.9 to 6.17	52
<u>CHAPTER 7 PRIORITIES OF AUSTRALIAN GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURE</u>	7.1 to 7.11	56
<u>CHAPTER 8 INCOME-RELATED PRINCIPLE</u>	8.1 to 8.28	61
1. The General Principle	8.1 to 8.3	61
2. The Appropriateness of 85% of Earnings as Compensation	8.4 to 8.14	62
3. Departures from the Income- Related Principle	8.15 to 8.28	66

	<u>CHAPTER 9 ASSESSMENT OF INCAPACITY</u>	9.1 to 9.28	74
1.	Introduction	9.1 to 9.5	74
2.	Permanent Partial Incapacity	9.6 to 9.10	75
3.	Temporary Partial Incapacity	9.11 to 9.12	76
4.	Total Incapacity	9.13 to 9.14	77
5.	Permanent Total Incapacity	9.15	77
6.	Temporary Total Incapacity	9.16	77
7.	The use of the A.M.A. "Guides to the Evaluation of Permanent Impairment"	9.17 to 9.18	77
8.	Difficulties for the Doctor in Using the "A.M.A Guides"	9.19	78
9.	Objections to the fairness of assessments under the "A.M.A. Guides" in cases of injury	9.20 to 9.23	78
10.	Use of the "A.M.A. Guides" in the case of sickness	9.24 to 9.28	79
	<u>CHAPTER 10 ELIGIBILITY AND EXCLUSIONS</u>	10.1 to 10.27	82
1.	Introduction	10.1 to 10.7	82
2.	Children - Persons under the "Qualifying Age"	10.8 to 10.16	85
3.	The Aged	10.17 to 10.24	88
4.	Criminals	10.25 to 10.28	91
	<u>CHAPTER 11 DEATH BENEFITS (Including Widows and Children and Relatives)</u>	11.1 to 11.19	93
	<u>CHAPTER 12 DOUBLE BENEFITS</u>	12.1 to 12.14	108
	<u>CHAPTER 13 EXPENSES ASSOCIATED WITH SICKNESS AND INJURY - CLAUSE 50</u>	13.1 to 13.19	116
	<u>CHAPTER 14 SOME MATTERS AFFECTING BENEFITS</u>	14.1 to 14.62	127
1.	Sickness Benefits	14.1 to 14.4	127
2.	Past Injuries and Sickness	14.5 to 14.13	127
3.	Maternity Benefits	14.14 to 14.16	133
4.	Employees in "Special Risk" Industries	14.17 to 14.21	134
5.	Priorities of Rehabilitation over Compensation	14.22 to 14.25	135
6.	Definition of "Personal Injury" (The Schedule of the Bill)	14.26 to 14.33	136
7.	Funeral Benefits	14.34 to 14.41	138
8.	Confidential Reports on Beneficiaries	14.42 to 14.50	140
9.	Suspension or Cancellation of Benefits	14.51 to 14.56	142
10.	Review of Benefit (Clauses 29 and 104)	14.57 to 14.61	143
11.	Commutation of Benefits (Clause 54)	14.62	145

<u>CHAPTER 15 BREADTH OF DISCRETIONS AND ADMINISTRATION</u>	15.1 to 15.13	146
Breadth of Discretions	15.1 to 15.6	146
Administration - Statutory Commission or Conventional Department	15.7 to 15.13	148
<u>CHAPTER 16 APPEAL PROVISIONS</u>	16.1 to 16.8	151
<u>CHAPTER 17 THE "ALTERNATIVE PLAN" OF THE INSURANCE INDUSTRY AND THE STATES</u>	17.1 to 17.13	155
<u>CHAPTER 18 COMMENTS ON THE DETAIL OF THE CLAUSES OF THE BILL</u>	18.1 to 18.2	164
Commentary by Mr. H. Luntz		165
<u>REPORT</u>		
<u>Addendum 1</u>	Addendum by the Chairman (Senator Everett)	182
<u>Addendum 2</u>	Addendum by Senators Button and Grimes	188
<u>Addendum 3</u>	Addendum by Senators Chaney, Missen and Wright	189
<u>Addendum 4</u>	Addendum by Senator Chaney	194
<u>Addendum 5</u>	An Addendum by Senator A.J. Missen on the "Alternative Plan" of the Insurance Industry and the States	195
	(1) Reasons Against the Bill	195
	(2) Arguments for an Alternative Scheme	195
	(3) Existing No-Fault Schemes	198
	(4) "The Alternative Plan"	200
	(5) Basic Recommendations	202
<u>Addendum 6</u>	Addendum by Senator Wright	203
	(A) Common Law Remedies	203
	(B) Criminals	211
	(C) Definition of Personal Injury	212
<u>Addendum 7</u>	Further Addendum by Senators Chaney, Missen and Wright Special Provisions as to Employees	215

<u>Appendix A</u>	List of Individuals and Organisations who made written submissions	220
<u>Appendix B</u>	List of Individuals and Representatives of Organisations who gave evidence before the Committee	223
<u>Appendix C</u>	Opinion of Queens Counsel	229
	1. Brief forwarded to Counsel	230
	2. Opinion of Mr. F.C. Brennan, Q.C.	233
	3. Opinion of Mr. A.M. Gleeson, Q.C.	259
	4. Opinion of Mr. R.E. McGarrie, Q.C.	278
	5. Opinion of Mr. M.H. Byers, Q.C. Solicitor General	295
	6. Brief to Counsel for an Opinion in Conference	309
	7. Memorandum of Advice by Mr. A.M. Gleeson, Q.C.	310
<u>Appendix D</u>	Section 120 of the Compensation Act 1972 of New Zealand as amended in 1974	315
<u>Appendix E</u>	Discretions of the Secretary contained in the National Compensation Bill 1974	318
<u>Appendix F</u>	Statistics and Estimates Supplied by the Treasury, Canberra	322
<u>Appendix G</u>	Notes on some drafting points by Mr. J.Q. Ewens	328
<u>Appendix H</u>	National Compensation Bill 1974 as read a first time in the Senate	333